

U.S. Department of Justice

Civil Division

Washington, DC 20530

January 3, 2013

VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL

David Sobel, Esq. Electronic Frontier Foundation 1818 N Street, N.W., Suite 410 Washington, DC 20036

Re: EFF v. Department of Justice, Case No. 12-1441-ABJ

Dear David,

Enclosed please find the Department of Justice's response to Electronic Frontier Foundation's Freedom of Information Act request to the Department's National Security Division dated July 26, 2012 requesting:

- 1. Any written opinion or order . . . in which "the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court held that some collection carried out pursuant to the Section 702 minimization procedures used by the government was unreasonable under the Fourth Amendment";
- 2. Any written opinion or order . . . reflecting or concerning a FISC determination that "the government's implementation of Section 702 of FISA has sometimes circumvented the spirit of the law"; and
- 3. Any briefing provided to the Senate Select Committee on Intelligence or the House Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence concerning the FISC opinions or orders, described in items (1) and (2) above.

After you have discussed the enclosed response with your client, please contact me to schedule a time to discuss the Joint Status Report that the parties must submit to the Court on January 18, 2013.

Thank you for your attention to this matter. I look forward to speaking with you soon.

Sincerely,

(JACQUELINE COLEMAN SNEAD

Senior Counsel Federal Programs Branch

Civil Division

Enclosure

U.S. Department of Justice



National Security Division

Washington, D.C. 20530

NSD #12-219 January 3, 2013

Mr. Mark Rumold Electronic Frontier Foundation 454 Shotwell Street San Francisco, CA 94110

Dear Mr. Rumold:

This is in response to your Freedom of Information Act Request (FOIA) dated July 26, 2012, concerning the July 20, 2012 letter to Senator Wyden and two statements contained therein: "It is also true that on at least one occasion the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court held that some collection carried out pursuant to Section 702 minimization procedures used by the government was unreasonable under the Fourth Amendment"; and "I believe that the government's implementation of Section 702 of FISA has sometimes circumvented the spirit of the law, and on at least one occasion the FISA Court has reached the same conclusion."

Your FOIA requests the following:

- 1. Any written opinion or order, as described in the statement quoted above, in which "the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court held that some collection carried out pursuant to the Section 702 minimization procedures used by the government was unreasonable under the Fourth Amendment";
- 2. Any written opinion or order, as described in the statement quoted above, reflecting or concerning a FISC determination that "the government's implementation of Section 702 of FISA has sometimes circumvented the spirit of the law"; and,
- 3. Any briefing provided to the Senate Select Committee on Intelligence or the House Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence concerning the FISC opinions or orders, described in items (1) and (2) above.

For your information, Congress excluded three discrete categories of law enforcement and national security records from the requirements of the FOIA. See 5 U.S.C. §552(c) (2006 & Supp. IV (2010)). This response is limited to those records that are subject to the requirements of the FOIA. This is a standard notification that is given to all our requesters and should not be taken as an indication that excluded records do, or do not, exist.

We have conducted a search of the Office of the Assistant Attorney General and the Office of Intelligence of the National Security Division and located records responsive to your

request.

We have identified two records (one of which is a non-identical duplicate of the other) that are responsive to items (1) and (2) of your request and a third record that is responsive to item (3) of your request. We are withholding the records in full pursuant to the following FOIA exemptions set forth in 5 U.S.C. 552(b):

- (1) which permits the withholding of information properly classified pursuant to Executive Order No. 13526; and
- (3) which permits the withholding of information specifically exempted from disclosure by statute (the applicable statute is 50 U.S.C. § 403-1(i)1 of the National Security Act of 1947).

We have also identified two additional records that are responsive to item (3) of your request [two joint statements for the record prepared for classified, closed Congressional hearings]. We have processed the two joint statements for the record and have attached a redacted version of each.

As this matter is already in litigation, we are omitting our standard appeal paragraph.

Sincerely.

Mark A. Bradley

Director

FOIA and Declassification







JOINT STATEMENT OF

LISA O. MONACO
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL
FOR NATIONAL SECURITY
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

JOHN C. (CHRIS) INGLIS
DEPUTY DIRECTOR
NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY

ROBERT S. LITT
GENERAL COUNSEL
OFFICE OF DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE

BEFORE THE
SENATE SELECT COMMITTEE ON INTELLIGENCE
UNITED STATES SENATE

AT A HEARING CONCERNING "FISA AMENDMENTS ACT REAUTHORIZATION"

PRESENTED ON FEBRUARY 9, 2012

(b) (1), (b) (3) (b) (1), (b) (3)

Joint Statement of

Lisa O. Monaco Assistant Attorney General for National Security U.S. Department of Justice

John C. (Chris) Inglis Deputy Director National Security Agency

Robert S. Litt
General Counsel
Office of Director of National Intelligence

Before the Senate Select Committee on Intelligence United States Senate

At a Hearing Concerning "FISA Amendments Act Reauthorization"

Presented on February 9, 2012

non-responsive	
	발생님이 되었다. 그렇게 막 보이는 이렇게 했다.
	그림 사이에 가면 가면 가장 나는 그리고 있다.
	그렇다 보고 있는 그런 그런 나를 보는 없습니다.

Worder Persponsive		*	
			14 15
			4.79
			-
			3.0
			75/89

non-responsive	
	역사 및 이번 시간에 발견되는 경기를 받는다.

non-responsive	_
[- 12 - 12 - 12 - 12 - 12 - 12 - 12 - 1	
[[편집 [[전] 12] [[D] [[D] 12] [[D]	
시시 사람들 마음이 되어 들었다. 속한 나는 그리고 있으면 그리고 있는 것은 것을 가장 하다 했다.	1
	1
	1

Won-responsive	
	The state of the s
	17°Y9L 01-5 1 1 1 1 1 1
D. D. A. FUGG O	
J) Recent FISC Opinion	
J) Recent FISC Opinion	
TS//SI//NF) (b) (1), (b) (3)	
TS//SI//NF) (b) (1), (b) (3)	
TS//SI//NF) (b) (1), (b) (3)	
TS//SI//NF) (b) (1), (b) (3)	
TS//SI//NF) (b) (1), (b) (3)	
TS//SI//NF) (a) (1), (b) (3)	
U) Recent FISC Opinion TS//SI//NF) (((b) (1) (2) (3) (3) b)((1) (b) (3)	

-(-ci-)	(1-)-7(b)-(3-)				
(1)(1)(3)) (3)) (3)					
relopments on t		ve will continue	to inform the Con	nmillee about an	iy additionar
i-responsive					A contract of the contract of

이 마음이 다른 사람이 이 항상 되지 않는데 되는 것이 많아 나는 사람들이 하는데 얼마를 보는데 하고 있다.
연극이 불렀다면 하는 회에 대한 이번 사람이 되었다. 그런 사람이 되었다는 것 같아 나를 맞아 내려가 되었다.
보고, 글로그램, 그리고 하는 다른 사람들이 하는 것은 나는 사람들이 되는 사람들이 되는 것이 되었다.

Moneyesponsive	
하는 경기에 대한 경험을 하는 것이 되었다면 보고 있다.	

non-responsive	The state of the s		
			7.04.417.44
			1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1
			The Market Land of the Land of

non-responsive	
	-
[[] 하는 [[] 하는 [] 등 []	
	1 4 1
	34.04

no-responsive	
	7.
	-
본경 내용 경기가 되었다. 그는 사람이 얼굴하다 하는 바람이 없는 나를 모하는 것이 없다.	
	AL-

or-responsive		







JOINT STATEMENT OF

LISA O. MONACO
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL
FOR NATIONAL SECURITY
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

JOHN C. (CHRIS) INGLIS
DEPUTY DIRECTOR
NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY

ROBERT S. LITT
GENERAL COUNSEL
OFFICE OF DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE

BEFORE THE
PERMANENT SELECT COMMITTEE ON INTELLIGENCE
UNITED STATES HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

AT A HEARING CONCERNING "FISA AMENDMENTS ACT REAUTHORIZATION"

PRESENTED ON DECEMBER 8, 2011

(b)(1)(1); (b) (3)

Joint Statement of

Lisa O. Monaco Assistant Attorney General for National Security U.S. Department of Justice

John C. (Chris) Inglis Deputy Director National Security Agency

Robert S. Litt
General Counsel
Office of Director of National Intelligence

Before the Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence United States House of Representatives

At a Hearing Concerning "FISA Amendments Act Reauthorization"

Presented on December 8, 2011

non-responsive	

non-responsive	
그리고 살이 보고 있는데 그는 그는 그는 그들은 사람들이 되었다면 살아왔다면 보다.	
보고 그렇게 하면 하는데 아이들은 전혀 되었다면 하다 되었다면 없다.	
요 이 사람은 이 집에 가고 있는 사람이 가는 것이 되었다. 그렇게 되었다.	
#F. 이 사람 전에 되었다. 경기는 이 경기에 되고 있다면 함께 되었다. [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1]	

non-responsive	

	Tion-responsive			
상 경상 하시고 하는 것 같은 것은 사람들은 사람들이 되었다. 그는 그들은 것 같은 사람들은 사람들이 없었다.				**

non-responsive	
[27] [27] [28] [28] [28] [28] [28] [28] [28] [28	
[[] 10(14) 12(14) 12(14) 12(14) 12(14) 12(14)	
[4일 : 80일 : 19일 : 19	
(U) Recent FISC Opinion	
(O) Recent PISC Opinion	
(TIC CT TIT) (h) (1) (h) (2)	
(TS//SI//NF) (1) (1) (3)	
(b) (1) (b) (3)	

(TC//CI//NIT	(b) (1), (b) (3)
(15//SI//NI	(b) (1) (b) (3) (b) (3)
(p) (1) 4 (p) (3)	b) (3)
New Year	
	b) (3)
(b) (1) - (b) (3)	(10)-(1)-(0)-(3)-(3)
(b) (1), (1	9) (3)
	(b) (1), (b) (3) - (b) (1), (b) (3)
bh(1) /a (b) (3)	b) (3)
(D) (1-) - (E	

(b) (1), (b) (3) (D)-(1), (D)-(3)
(\$P\(\frac{1}{1}\frac{1}\frac{1}\frac{1}{1}\frac{1}{1}\frac{1}\frac{1}{1}\frac{1}{1}\frac{1}{1}\frac{1}{1}\fra
(U) The Government has provided copies of the opinions and the filings by the Government to this Committee, and the Government will continue to inform the Committee about developments in this matter.
Partesponsi ve. si ve

hr-responsive				

Word-Pesponsive		
	Market Commission of the Commi	

non-responsive	
H 보기가는 보기하게 되었다. 그게 되고 그렇게 보고 있는데 이번 다른데 있는데 다른데 다른데 다른데 다른데 다른데 다른데 다른데 다른데 다른데 다른	
그 경기 이 살아보다 그 사람들이 가장 나는 사람들이 되었다고 있다면 하는데 하는데 되었다.	
전투 시간적인가 ("주문장인 New York All House Hall House	
사람은 60는 1일 대한 대한 사람들이 아름다면 하다면 하는 것이 되었다면 하는 것이다. 네트란드	
나는 이 보이는 살이면서 고개를 하고 있었다면서 그는 이번 보이는 모든 사람들이 없었다면 했다.	
	Hybrid

non-responsive	

no-responsive	
[[[조막 [[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[
어느 그렇게 하는 그들이 그는 사이에서 하는 그 이번 사람들이 가게 되었다. 이번 나는 이번	

non-responsive		